

---

MEETING	SCRUTINY MANAGEMENT COMMITTEE
DATE	17 SEPTEMBER 2007
PRESENT	COUNCILLORS GALVIN (CHAIR), SIMPSON-LAING, SCOTT, TAYLOR, R WATSON, HYMAN (AS SUBSTITUTE FOR MOORE) AND HOLVEY (AS SUBSTITUTE FOR KIRK) <i>[AS AMENDED AT THE MEETING ON 22 OCTOBER 2007]</i>
APOLOGIES	COUNCILLORS BLANCHARD, KIRK AND MOORE
IN ATTENDANCE	COUNCILLOR WATT FOR MINUTE NO. 20 BELOW

---

**16. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

No declarations of interest were made at the meeting.

**17. MINUTES**

The minutes of the last meeting of the Committee held on 23 July 2007 were agreed as a correct record and signed by the Chair.

**18. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION**

The Chair reported that no registrations to speak at the meeting had been made under the Public Participation Scheme.

**19. LOOKING AHEAD AT SCRUTINY IN YORK AND THE ROLE OF SCRUTINY MANAGEMENT COMMITTEE**

Members considered a report outlining the potential for refocusing the role of Scrutiny Management Committee (SMC) within the Council, in order to enable it set its own annual objectives and scrutiny topics. Members were advised that any change to the working practices of SMC would require constitutional amendment and, as such, would initially need to be reported to Audit & Governance Committee.

A full discussion was held on the proposals and in general, Members felt that the role and operation of SMC should continue as present and the report and consideration of the issues should be deferred for 6 months to enable the position to be reviewed, monitored and assessed.

RESOLVED: That the report be deferred for 6 months to enable the existing role of SMC to be sufficiently monitored and reviewed if necessary.

## **20. PROPOSED SCRUTINY REVIEW OF SALE OF THE BARBICAN AND SWIMMING FACILITIES IN YORK**

Members reconsidered the feasibility report on the above proposed topic registered by Councillor Watt, who had attended the meeting to clarify his purpose in submitting the topic for potential review.

A full discussion on the proposed topic took place and Members sought Cllr Watt's views on their revised suggestions for reviewing the topic he had registered.

Members generally were agreed that a review of the arrangements surrounding the sale of the Barbican site would be useful with a view to learning some key lessons for the future in relation to proposals of a similar nature/scope. They did not, however, believe it would be beneficial to incorporate any review of swimming provision, given that this work was effectively being undertaken through a commissioned 'review' report to the Executive. Cllr Watt agreed to revise his topic submission. As such the following objectives for review were agreed by SMC:

- To understand why the contract in relation to the sale of the Barbican site was not signed, sealed and delivered until May 2003;
- To understand the public consultation processes which took place and the resulting decisions;
- To understand the changes in land values with a view to establishing whether best value was actually achieved in this case; and
- To assess whether decisions taken in relation to the sale resulted in a loss of capital to the Council.

RESOLVED:

- (i) That the above objectives be agreed as a potential remit for scrutinising the arrangements for the sale of the Barbican site, as proposed by Councillor Watt; and
- (ii) That an Ad-Hoc Scrutiny Sub-Committee be established on a 2:2:1 basis with a Fishergate Ward Councillor being co-opted on to the Sub-Committee and Councillor Looker being invited to Chair.

Cllr Galvin, Chair

[The meeting started at 5.30 pm and finished at 6.35 pm].